

MENTOR CRITIQUE FORM

Your thoughtful and honest appraisal will be most helpful. We appreciate your input and will try to implement as many of your ideas as possible. Continue comments on the back if necessary. Each Fellow works with one mentor who is Soros foundations network-affiliated (usually Open Society Institute and Central European University) and one or two 'external' mentor(s) who are experts in the field working outside the Soros foundations network. Mentors should: 1) Work with Fellows to devise a brief policy paper in their field(s) of expertise based on a lengthy research paper written over the course of the fellowship year, 2) Maintain contact with Fellows at least once every six weeks or so by telephone, fax or e-mail to discuss the development of projects, 3) If feasible, meet with Fellows at least once during the fellowship year to discuss the project, 4) Facilitate Fellows' contact with other relevant experts and participation in appropriate meetings (IPF has discretionary funds to support Fellow attendance at relevant events), 5) Complete brief mid-term and final critique forms supplied by IPF to provide the program with feedback regarding the Fellow's progress.

Your name, position:

Hana Ross,
*Senior Research Specialist,
University Illinois Chicago*

Name of Fellow you have assisted:

Paruyr V. Amirjanyan

1. What, in your opinion, have you and your Fellow/program/project gained from your cooperation thus far?

I have learned how to advice on a preparation of a research report in the situation when data is very scarce, incomplete or unavailable.

Mr. Amirjanyan made an immense progress in secondary data collection, improved his analytical and presentation skills and learned useful methodological approaches to analysing the demand for tobacco in Armenia.

We both learned together what kind of essential data are missing in Armenia and have now a better understanding of what kind of research would be the most beneficial and the most cost effective in the country.

2. Do certain areas of this Fellow's work need improvement? Which areas?

I would suggest a course in econometric estimating techniques, a course in advanced statistical methods, and a course in writing a research paper.

3. In your opinion, does your Fellow's project make a significant contribution to the field?

Yes, the type of information provided in Mr. Amirjanyan's paper will be very useful for local tobacco advocate groups when negotiation the content of the recently discussed tobacco control law in Armenia. In my opinion the study has a good chance to be published in an international journal.

4. Would the project be important to other countries in the CEE/FSU region?

YES

Similar studies can be replicated in other countries in the CEE/FSU region.

5. Could the proposed policy research make an impact on the policy environment in specific countries or regions? (Policy makers, experts and policy research community)

YES

This project demonstrates the high opportunity costs of tobacco control, particularly in countries with low level of income. The result of such studies not only call for sound public policy measures to control smoking, but can also draw an emotional appeal among public policy makers.

6. Is the timetable for the project realistic?

YES

7. Could the project benefit a large number of people?

YES

The results of this research study provide a valuable insight into costs of tobacco consumption in a low-income country.

8. Does the Fellow show evidence that he/she can think strategically about the relevant project and/or field?

YES

Mr. Amirjanyan is particularly gifted strategic thinker with a deep understanding of political situation in his country and in countries in the region.

9. If the Fellow were to re-apply for continued OSI funding for follow-up work associated with the project, would you support continued funding?

YES

Mr. Amirjanyan demonstrated good analytical skills, and I am convinced that he can apply them successfully to his future projects.

10. Are there other appropriate funders that may support the project?

I don't know.

Recommendations for other potential senior contacts for this Fellow:

None.

Additional Comments (Please comment on your Fellow's work and all aspects of the IPF program using the back of this sheet):

No additional comments. Please contact me at hanaross@uic.edu for clarification or further questions.